How good are our estimates? $_{\rm OOO}$

Approximating rational numbers

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ・三 のへぐ

A Shady Summation

Misha (misha.p.l@gmail.com)



May 24, 2020: VMC Sneak Peek

イロト イボト イヨト イヨト ヨー のくや

The summation

This class is about a single sum:

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\lceil \pi n \rceil}{7^n} = \frac{\lceil \pi \rceil}{7} + \frac{\lceil 2\pi \rceil}{7^2} + \frac{\lceil 3\pi \rceil}{7^3} + \cdots$$

Let's use the most advanced techniques to evaluate this sum and try to understand it.



Introduction	
000	

How good are our estimates?

Approximating rational numbers

What WolframAlpha says



🛓 Download Page

POWERED BY THE WOLFRAM LANGUAGE

Looking at that approximation, there is a natural guess to make: obviously, the exact value $\frac{926\,485}{1\,235\,313}$.

Mathematica says...this is pretty good!

$$\ln[3] = N\left[Sum\left[\frac{Ceiling[Pin]}{7^{n}}, \{n, 1, 100\}\right] - \frac{926485}{1235313}\right]$$

Out[3] = -1.64117 × 10⁻⁸³

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ○ ● ●

Questions we still have:

- Why was it so close to $\frac{3}{4}$?
- **2** Is it actually $\frac{926\,485}{1\,235\,313}$?
- If not, is it equal to anything nice?

How good are our estimates?

Approximating rational numbers 0000

Where does $\frac{3}{4}$ come from?

Things we know about π : it is a bit bigger than 3.

For small values of *n*, then, we expect to get $\lceil \pi n \rceil = 3n + 1$.

We have

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{3n+1}{7^n} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{7^n} + 3\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{n}{7^n} = \frac{1}{6} + 3 \cdot \frac{7}{36} = \frac{3}{4}$$

Of course this is not going to give us the correct terms. But the first wrong term is when n = 8:

$$\frac{3n+1}{7^n} = \frac{25}{7^8} \qquad \frac{\lceil \pi n \rceil}{7^n} = \frac{26}{7^8}$$

This is going to be most of the error, and $\frac{1}{7^8}$ is only about 0.000000173....

Introduction

How good are our estimates? $\circ \circ \circ$

Approximating rational numbers 0000

Aside: computing $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{n}{7^n}$

Write $\frac{n}{7^n}$ as a sum:

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{n}{7^n} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{1}{7^n}.$$

Swap the order of summations:

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{1}{7^n} = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \sum_{n=k}^{\infty} \frac{1}{7^n}.$$

Use the geometric series formula... twice:

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \sum_{n=k}^{\infty} \frac{1}{7^n} = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1/7^k}{1-\frac{1}{7}} = \frac{\frac{1/7^1}{1-\frac{1}{7}}}{1-\frac{1}{7}} = \frac{7}{36}.$$

Introduction How good are our estimates? Approximating rational numbers 000 26 4 8 5 The e 235 313

What's up with our second guess, $\frac{926\,485}{1\,235\,313}$?

We know a bit more about π : we have $\pi \approx \frac{22}{7}$. Computing the sum

is much more annoying, but works the same way as our previous sum, and gives $\frac{926\,485}{1\,235\,313}$ as an answer.

What is the error here? Well, a third, much better approximation to π is $\frac{355}{113}$.

The first time $\left\lceil \frac{22}{7}n \right\rceil$ and $\left\lceil \frac{355}{113}n \right\rceil$ disagree is when n = 113. This contributes most of the error: $7^{-113} \approx 3.19 \times 10^{-96}$.

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\left\lceil \frac{22}{7}n \right\rceil}{7^n}$$

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\left\lceil \frac{22}{7}n \right\rceil}{7^n}$$

rror in
$$\frac{g}{1}$$

The answer is not rational

Theorem

The value of
$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\lceil \pi n \rceil}{7^n}$$
 is irrational.

I will only sketch the proof, leaving out a few details. Assumptions:

- There is no end to approximations of π like $\frac{22}{7}, \frac{355}{113}, \frac{104\,348}{33\,215}, \dots$
- **②** Consecutive approximations have a nice relationship: e.g., $\left\lceil \frac{22}{7}n \right\rceil$ and $\left\lceil \frac{355}{113}n \right\rceil$ first disagree at n = 113.

These are both true for all irrational numbers; nothing special about π .

Rational numbers are hard to approximate!

Rational numbers are hard to approximate! Here is a number line of the rational numbers in [0, 1] with denominator at most 20:

There are gaps around fractions with small denominator, like 1 or $\frac{1}{3}$ or $\frac{3}{4}.$

Algebraically: if
$$rac{p}{q}
eq rac{3}{4}$$
, then $\left|rac{3}{4} - rac{p}{q}\right| = rac{|3q-4p|}{4q} \geq rac{1}{4q}$.

◆□ → ◆□ → ◆ 三 → ◆ 三 → ● ◆ ●

How good are our estimates?

Approximating rational numbers 0000

Our sum is easy to approximate!

Our sum is easy to approximate: it is within about 7^{-8} of $\frac{3}{4}$.

If
$$\left|\frac{3}{4}-\frac{p}{q}\right|\approx7^{-8}$$
, then q is at least about $\frac{7^8}{4}$.

There's more: our sum is within about 7^{-113} of $\frac{926\,485}{1\,235\,313}$.

If
$$\left|\frac{926\,485}{1\,235\,313} - \frac{p}{q}\right| \approx 7^{-113}$$
, then q is at least about $\frac{7^{113}}{1\,235\,313}$.

These lower bounds keep going. The next one will be about $\frac{7^{33\,215}}{7^{113}}$, by comparing the sum with $\frac{355}{113}$ to the better approximation $\pi \approx \frac{104\,348}{33\,215}$.

Our sum cannot be rational: it can be approximated by rational numbers much better than any rational number ever could!

Further reading

These slides: https://tinyurl.com/shadysum

The inspiration for the shady sum: a paper called *Strange Series* and *High-Precision Fraud* by Borwein and Borwein.

More about approximating π (and other numbers): http://www.ams.org/publicoutreach/feature-column/fcarc-irrational1